

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Ltd

2<sup>ND</sup> Minutes of Meetings of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for First Stage Evaluation, held at NHIDCL New Delhi on 15.02.2019 at 3:00 PM for Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for supervision of:

- (i) Up-gradation to 4-lane with Paved Shoulder of Jammu-Akhnoor road section of NH-144A from Canal head (Km 0.800) to Ganesh Vihar (Km 6.000) of 5.2 Km length
- (ii) Up-gradation to 4-lane with Paved Shoulder of Jammu-Akhnoor road section of NH-144A from Ganesh Vihar (Km 6.000) to Hanuman Chowk (Km 30.000) of 24 Km length in the state of Jammu and Kashmir to be executed on EPC basis.
- (iii) Widening and Up-gradation to 2 lane with paved shoulder configuration and geometric improvement from km 0.000 to km 16.990 on Chenani - Sudhmahadev section of NH-244 in the state of Jammu and Kashmir to be executed on EPC basis.

For the subject project 10 bids were received on CPP Portal by due date and time i.e. on 19.11.2018 at 1100 Hrs.

2. After receiving the comments on 1<sup>st</sup> Evaluation of technical bids, the Committee met on 15.02.2019.

3. The Committee was informed that with the approval of the Competent Authority, results of Proof of Eligibility along with the Minutes of Meeting were uploaded on the NHIDCL website. Applicant firms were requested to offer their comments on the Stage-I Evaluation within 7 days time. Representation from the bidders were received vis-à-vis the 1<sup>st</sup> Stage evaluation results. The bidders have furnished the following comments:

**3.1 M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited**

Committee noted that the bid was considered non-responsive as the names of the DSC holder and POA holder were not same. The bidder has since clarified through a submission of affidavit that the person holding DSC Virender Singh and POA holder V.S Vats are the same person. The Committee considered the same for further evaluation of the 1st stage eligibility. The result of the bidder is attached in Appendix-I.

**3.2 M/s Stup Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Transtek Engineers & Services Pvt. Ltd.**

Committee noted that the bid was considered non-responsive as the names of the DSC holder and POA holder were not same. The bidder has since clarified through a submission of affidavit that the person holding DSC Ashim Sircar Guha and POA holder A. Guha Sircar are the same person. The Committee considered the same for further evaluation of the 1<sup>st</sup> stage eligibility. The result of the bidder is attached in Appendix-II.

### 3.3 M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited in Association with Canvas Consultancy

No representation was received from the bidder regarding the 1<sup>st</sup> Stage result.

### 3.4 M/s Indian Tecnocrat Limited in Association with KS Infra Consultants (LLP)

In the comments vide letter dated 03.01.2019 the bidder claimed to consider Sl no 26, 5, 22, 31, 09, 38 & 27 into consideration for the 1<sup>st</sup> Stage Evaluation. The Committee noted that for the sl no 26, as the bidder has submitted 99% completion certificate, the Committee decided to consider the same. The Sl no 05, 22 and 31 were cross-checked and it was found that the evaluation is correct. The projects with sl no 09, 38 & 27, are enlisted twice and are already considered once each for evaluation. The revised result of the bidder is attached in Appendix-III.

### 3.5 M/s TPF Getinsa Euroestudios S.L. in Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.

In the comments vide letter dated 02.1.2019 the bidder claimed to consider Projects from page number 80-86, 128-136, 148-152 & 185-190 from their submitted hard copies. Committee noted that even though these projects are uploaded on the INFRACON Portal, these projects are older than 7 years. Hence, committee recommended that the published results are correct.

3.6 The revised result of the 1<sup>st</sup> Stage Evaluation be communicated to the bidder as under:

S. No.	Name of the Applicants	Status of Eligibility
1.	M/s Voyants Solutions Private Limited	Not Eligible
2.	M/s REDECON (INDIA) PVT LTD	Eligible
3.	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited	Eligible
4.	M/s RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.	Eligible
5.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. In Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible
6.	M/s Stup Consultants Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Transtek Engineers & Services Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible
7.	M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED In Association with Casta Engineers Pvt. Ltd	Eligible
8.	M/s Indian Tecnocrat Limited In Association with KS INFRA CONSULTANTS(LLP)	Not Eligible
9.	M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD In Association with Manglam Associates	Eligible
10.	M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited In Association with Canvas Consultancy	Not Eligible

## 4. 2<sup>nd</sup> Stage Evaluation

4.1 As per para 3 of 1<sup>st</sup> MOM, ETEC was apprised that the results so obtained through INFRACON were further validated by carrying out the manual evaluation vis-à-vis the INFRACON evaluation.



4.2 ETEC noted that the marks accorded towards relevant experience for the assignment is as per the project considered eligible during the 1<sup>st</sup> Stage Evaluation and accordingly the firms have scored marks (Appendix-IV).

**4.2.1 M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD In Association with Manglam Associates**

i. In the comments vide letter dated 04.1.2019 M/s Yongma Engineering Co Ltd In Association with Manglam Associates claimed to consider the projects into consideration projects on Sl No 7, 14, 89, 108. The Committee after examination found that, additional documents in support of the claim for the project are provided for Sl no 14 & 89, hence they shall be considered. The rest of the result for the bidder remains unchanged.

4.3 The CVs of the Key Personnel were also evaluated and checked against the marks accorded by the INFRACON. The detail of evaluation is as per Appendix-V and further supported by the calculations in respect of each individual key personnel with Annexures.

5. ETEC noted that as per Clause 3.4 (iv) (c) of Section 2, RFP reads, **“Zero marks shall be given to such CVs, if any of the below is applicable:**

- The CV of same person is submitted by two or more firms
- The name of the Key Personnel is not same in the uploaded CV and as mentioned in the degree certificate and no legal document submitted for justification
- The Key Personnel has any other active CV on INFRACON portal, as on the date of invitation of bid”

5.1 Accordingly as per the Clause 3.4 (iv) (c) following CV’s has been awarded zero marks. Details are as under:

i. Name not same in the degree certificate & uploaded CV:

Sl No	Designation	Proposed by the Firm	Name on CV (INFRACON)	Name on Certificate	Remarks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	M/s REDECON (INDIA) PVT LTD	S. Waris	Shaik Waris	Not Exactly Same
2	Senior Quantity Surveyor-I		Shashi Shekhar Misra	Shashi Shekhar Mishra	Not Exactly Same
3	Material Engineer-II		Abdul Ghani Javid	Mohammed Abdul Ghani Javid	Not Exactly Same
4	Resident Engineer Cum Road Safety Expert	M/s FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED	Omar Farooq	Omer Farooq Ahmed	Not Exactly Same
5	Sr. Contract Specialist	M/s RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD	Kanhaaya D Singh	Kanhaaya Dayal Singh	Not Exactly Same
6	Senior Quantity Surveyor-I	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. IN ASSOCIATION WITH SEGMENTAL	Ashok Kumar Parvan	Ashok Kumar	Not Exactly Same

Sl No	Designation	Proposed by the Firm	Name on CV (INFRACON)	Name on Certificate	Remarks
		CONSULTING & INFRASTRUCTURE ADVISORY PVT. LTD.			
7	Material Engineer-I	M/s STUP CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH TRANSTEK ENGINEERS & SERVICES PVT. LTD.	Ajay Kumar Prasad	Ajay Kumar	Not Exactly Same
8	Bridge & Structural Engineer-III	M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN ASSOCIATION WITH CASTA ENGINEERS PVT LTD	Praveen Kumar Chaturvedi	Pravin Kumar Chaturvedi	Not Exactly Same
9	Bridge & Structural Engineer-I	M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD IN ASSOCIATION WITH MANGLAM ASSOCIATES	Anil Kumar Misri	Anil Misri	Not Exactly Same

ii. The following key personnel have 2 active CVs on INFRACON Portal:

Sl No	Designation	Proposed by the Firm	Name on CV	Active CV in the Name of	No of CV Active
1	Highway Design Specialist	M/s REDECON (INDIA) PVT LTD	K.P. Abraham	KP Abraham	2
2	Resident Engineer Cum Road Safety Expert	M/s STUP CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH TRANSTEK ENGINEERS & SERVICES PVT. LTD.	Neeraj Kumar	Neeraj Kumar	2
3	Bridge & Structural Engineer-II		Arun Kumar	Arun Kumar	2

6. ETEC while carrying out the evaluations also noted the following:

6.1 As per the clause Clause 3.4 (iv) (c) of RFP as mentioned in para 5 above & clause 3.4 (f) of Section 2, of RFP which reads, "In case more than 3 CV scores less than 75% marks or Team leader cum Highway Engineer scores less than 75% marks, the proposal shall be considered non-responsive." The following Key Personnel failed to score 75% marks:

Sl No	Name of Firms	Name of Key Personnel	Position	Responsive/Non-Responsive
1	REDECON (INDIA) PVT LTD	S. Waris	Team Leader cum	Non-Responsive

Sl No	Name of Firms	Name of Key Personnel	Position	Responsive/Non-Responsive
			Senior Highway Engineer	
2		Shashi Shekhar Misra	Senior Quantity Surveyor-I	
3		Abdul Ghani Javid	Material Engineer-II	
4		K. P. Abraham	Highway Design Specialist	
5		Anil Kumar Mishra	Bridge/ Structural Engineer-III	
6	FEEDBACK INFRA PRIVATE LIMITED	Omar Farooq	Resident Engineer Cum Road Safety Expert	Responsive
7		Kanhaaya D Singh	Sr. Contract Specialist	
8	RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.	Harihar Singh	Material Engineer-I	Responsive
9		Ashok Kumar Parvan	Senior Quantity Surveyor-I	
10	TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. IN ASSOCIATION WITH SEGMENTAL CONSULTING & INFRASTRUCTURE ADVISORY PVT. LTD.	Nigamananda Adhikari	Bridge Design Specialist	Responsive
11		Neeraj Kumar	Resident Engineer Cum Road Safety Expert	
12		Ajay Kumar Prasad	Material Engineer-I	
13	STUP CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH TRANSTEK ENGINEERS & SERVICES PVT. LTD.	Shivendra Kumar	Bridge/ Structural Engineer-I	Non-Responsive
14		Arun Kumar	Bridge/ Structural Engineer-II	
15		Dinendra Pratap Singh	Senior Quantity Surveyor-II	
16		Col Rajeev Kumar	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	
17	SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN ASSOCIATION WITH CASTA ENGINEERS PVT LTD	Anup Bag	Highway Design Specialist	Non-Responsive
18		Praveen Kumar Chaturvedi	Bridge/ Structural Engineer-III	
19	YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD IN ASSOCIATION WITH MANGLAM ASSOCIATES	Anil Kumar Misri	Bridge & Structural Engineer-I	Responsive



## 6.2 M/s REDECON (INDIA) PVT LTD

### i. Bridge & Structural Engineer-III:

- ii. The degree certificate of the Key Personnel Anil Kumar Mishra certifies him for a degree in Construction Engineering Branch. Hence, the CV has been accorded zero marks.

## 6.3 M/s STUP CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD. IN ASSOCIATION WITH TRANSTEK ENGINEERS & SERVICES PVT. LTD.

### i. Senior Quantity Surveyor-II:

Mr. Dinendra Pratap Singh has only submitted his College leaving certificate instead of his degree certificate. Hence, the CV has been accorded zero marks.

## 6.4 M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED IN ASSOCIATION WITH CASTA ENGINEERS PVT LTD

### i. Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer:

The Key personnel Col Rajeev Kumar claims the following position without mentioning his rank in his career in the following departments:

Sl no	Client	Designation	Start Date	Completion Date
1	Border Roads Organization	Deputy Engineer	01/07/1994	31/07/1997
2	Border Roads Organization	Deputy Executive Engineer	01/08/1997	31/07/2000
3	Indian Army	Executive Engineer	01/08/2000	31/03/2003
4	Indian Army	Chief Engineer / Superintending Engineer	01/04/2004	31/03/2007
5	Border Roads Organization	Chief Engineer / Superintending Engineer	01/04/2007	31/12/2009
6	Indian Army	Chief Engineer	01/01/2010	31/08/2011
7	Indian Army	Chief Engineer / Superintending Engineer	01/09/2011	31/12/2013
8	Indian Army	Chief Engineer	01/01/2014	31/01/2015
9	Indian Army	Chief Engineer / Superintending Engineer	01/02/2015	31/05/2017
10	Border Roads Organization	Team Leader cum Sr. Highway Engineer	01/06/2017	24/04/2018

While working in Indian Army instead of mentioning his rank he claims to be working as Executive Engineer, Chief Engineer/ Superintending Engineer & Chief Engineer. In his project description, the Key Personnel mentions himself involved in the supervision of National Highways while working for Indian Army. He became Chief Engineer during 01.01.2010 to 31.08.2011. Then again during 01.09.2011 to 31.12.2013, he became Chief Engineer/ Superintending Engineer. The CV accordingly being ambiguous has not been considered.

### ii. Bridge & Structural Engineer-III:

Mr. Praveen Kumar Chaturvedi has only submitted his College leaving certificate instead of his degree certificate. Hence, the CV has been accorded zero marks.

6.5 Further, ETEC evaluated 2<sup>nd</sup> stage evaluation of the technically responsive firms viz 4 nos. The marks scored by an individual firm is as under:


<u>Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals</u>						
S. No.	Description	Maximum Marks	Feedback Infra Private Limited	RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.	TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. In Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD In Association with Manglam Associates
1	Relevant experience for assignments	25	25.00	24.25	25.00	24.00
2	Qualifications and competence of the key personnel	75	59.30	58.96	63.08	60.01
	Total marks	100	84.30	83.21	88.08	84.01

6.6 In view of the above, the Committee recommends that all the 4 bidders are eligible for financial bid opening:

S. No.	Name of the Applicants	Status of Eligibility
1.	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited	Eligible
2.	M/s RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.	Eligible
3.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. In Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible
4.	M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD In Association with Manglam Associates	Eligible

6.7 The bidder may be given 7 days to respond or make representation to the result of second stage.

Meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the chair.

  
Pradeep Sharma, GM (T)  
( Member Secretary )

  
Uttam Chatterjee, DGM (Fin.)  
(Member)

  
Adil Singh, GM (Tech.)  
(Member)

  
Sanjeev Malik, ED-III  
(Convenor)

